| **Student Name:** Nancy Zhao |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  We should have a strong hook highlighting our biggest reason or our framing, rather than introducing ourselves or the motion.  We need to signpost - explain the structure of our speech prior to going into set-up.   * Good work describing the status quo - we should explain how or why this trend is occurring and what it indicates. * Good on purpose of holistic learning; good comparison between prop and opp in terms of what occurs. Excellent on burden pushing what the other side must defend. * Clear explanation on the status of ST. Good on a mix of grades + other activities. * Keep in mind these are four minute speeches, hence you need to make set-up much speedier!   Argument 1   * I buy that there is an increase in platforms and are more likely to develop talent in a supportive environment; we need to focus more closely on the exclusivity of this benefit. Why is this impossible to do in Opp’s world? For instance, currently these other facets are seen as distracting, or only hobbies rather than being able to take them seriously. * What is the impact of this argument?   We have a natural and clear way of speaking - well done! We should focus next on varying our tone and changing up our volume.  03:57 - good work!  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Andrew Man |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Excellent opening, highlighting what the motion mandates. We need to unpack this a little bit further - for instance, that we generalise rather than specialise; we shouldn’t dumb school down because school currently is too stressful. There are other ways to mitigate stress.  Is boredom the tipping point in the debate?  Signposting missing.  Counter-set-up   * Good on mitigations + exposure of HL; explain how this happens in the status quo etc.   Argument 1   * Clear premise. Good on grades being a symmetric incentive; I will note that this context is very Asian/high achieving. Is this true of the average student? Is this argument true of the average student? * Good on distraction + time being zero-sum. * Why would they be forced into signing or arts; why is implementation going to occur in this way? * Good impacting on career. Explain why career matters!   04:18  Well done. This is a solid, clear speech.  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Hon Sum Yang |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  What is the takeaway of this opening? Is it that students are bored as Andrew says, or rather does this challenge that directly? We have to spell this out more clearly. Well identified, our execution needs work. Explain why Opp is the side that bores children comparatively.  Are we letting them choose what to learn? Does holistic learning entail student choice?  We also spent a whole minute and forty seconds on our opening.  Rebuttal   * Identify the mechanism/premise of the argument and attack that instead! * Is it that this is repetitive, or that it’s too stressful or too singularly focused? * Excellent response to the POI? Should you have taken two POIs..? Did you have time for this in your speech? * Why is balance needed? What is wrong with the status quo? Link this to your argument on mental health!   Argument 1   * Explain why even academics focused on standardised testing is bad. * How do our education systems change when this model gets implemented? * Good impacting on stress!   04:12 - this is a much clearer speech. Good improvement! Well done!  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Ishan Harishankar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why is this debate exclusively about high achievers? In all debates, our focus needs to be on the most average iteration of the relevant stakeholder. We aren’t really engaging with the students with mental health issues or who are super stressed in status quo.  Rebuttal   * Identify the mechanism/premise of the argument and attack that instead! * On stress - explain how now their hobbies get stressful too; for instance, what used to be an outlet becomes something you get tested on. This is the response you need to run! * We aren’t engaging on mental health at all!   Argument 1   * Why will they find them boring? Do they prefer standardised learning? We need to spend more time characterising students realistically. * Good work structuring your analysis super clearly. * POI: is this a fair characterisation of what a focus on SL is? * Why are students better off? Is getting better at SL easier than HL? You need to unpack this claim!   04:18  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Shawn Nip |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Challenge boredom straight up. Is their case in any way helpful or applicable to anyone other than a high achieving student? Our opening is fair, but can be cleaner.  Rebuttal   * Good clarification; explain why the social growth and physical growth matters so much and is being stumped at the moment. * Clear explanation of how your side helps mitigate stress; good explanation of how HL works. * You need to engage with their characterisation - is this debate about high achievers? In all debates, our focus needs to be on the most average iteration of the relevant stakeholder. Who is the most vulnerable student?   Why are soft skills so important and impossible to get otherwise? Are soft skills exclusive? Or is stress exclusive? Your path to victory needs to be clearer!  Where are your clashes?  03:53  Explain why they are forced - what culture or kind of test is SL? For instance, right and wrong, clear scores, percentiles and rankings. Ask what matters or is necessary for societal and child development. Good reference to mental health crisis - we need to blow this up further.  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Bernard Chong |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I want a clear, simple opening! What are you winning on or losing on?  POI: why will it be more stressful? You need to explain how now their hobbies get stressful too; for instance, what used to be an outlet becomes something you get tested on. This is the response you need to run!  As third, you should not spend so much time on extraneous rebuttals. Jump straight into your clashes!  Clash 1 - Effectiveness   * Why couldn’t our earlier responses have gone here? * Is that there is no benefit or that there is no exclusive benefit? * Don’t spend so much time on POIs; do the quick answer and move on! Otherwise, you’re spending too much time on something that is not debate winning/losing.   Clash 2 - HL necessary?   * Why couldn’t our earlier responses have gone here? * You could’ve said you’d answer your POI here!   Why is this debate exclusively about high achievers? In all debates, our focus needs to be on the most average iteration of the relevant stakeholder. We aren’t really engaging with the students with mental health issues or who are super stressed in status quo.  Our tone is a lot stronger and clearer today! Well done!  04:12  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Daryl Ng |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Opening needs to be clearer. You need to engage with their characterisation - is this debate about high achievers? In all debates, our focus needs to be on the most average iteration of the relevant stakeholder. Who is the most vulnerable student?  Structure? Do you have questions you’re going to answer, or provide clashes?  Good on better situation; who does this benefit and why does it matter? What does standardised testing measure and is this a school system we want to keep?  Fair on boredom being a wash. Good on overall growth. Explain why the social growth and physical growth matters so much and is being stumped at the moment. Why is ST the single worst way to achieve this?  Why are soft skills so important and impossible to get otherwise? Are soft skills exclusive? Or is stress exclusive? Your path to victory needs to be clearer!  02:07  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Boris Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This House would place an emphasis on holistic learning over standardised testing in schools. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Why isn’t it effective or why doesn’t it prepare for the future? Give me a one liner explaining this here instead, and it will be far stronger and have a higher impact! Our opening is too descriptive and not as actionable.  What is the structure of this speech?  Why are ECAs sufficient? GOOD ON OPTIONALITY. You need to explain how now their hobbies get stressful too; for instance, what used to be an outlet becomes something you get tested on. This is the response you need to run! Explain what the implication of this on their case is!  Why will it be boring?  Why is this debate exclusively about high achievers? In all debates, our focus needs to be on the most average iteration of the relevant stakeholder. We aren’t really engaging with the students with mental health issues or who are super stressed in status quo.  Our tone is a lot clearer today! Well done!  02:25  We need to ask POIs consistently. This comment applies to everyone in class! | | | | | | |